### **COUNTY OF EL PASO**



### **CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION**

# REGULAR MEETING MINUTES 1:00 P.M., TUESDAY, MAY 7, 2013 COMMISSIONER'S COURTROOM, ROOM 303 500 E. SAN ANTONIO EL PASO, TEXAS 79901

Selena N. Solis, Chair

Grace D. Munoz, Commissioner

Carlos Gomez, Commissioner

## **OPEN MEETING**

The meeting was called to order at 1:14 p.m. Staff present were Kevin McCary from the County Attorney's Office, Elsie West & Estela Salgado, from the Human Resources Department. A full quorum was established with all members present.

# **PUBLIC COMMENT**

NO PUBLIC COMMENT

### APPROVED - CONSENT AGENDA

MAY 7, 2013

MOTION #1 (ITEM #1)

APPROVE THE MINUTES OF THE REGULARLY SCHEDULED CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION MEETING OF APRIL 2, 2013.

--Betsy C. Keller, Human Resources

On this day, on motion of Commissioner Gomez, seconded by Commissioner Munoz, it is the order of the Commission to approve Consent Agenda Item #1 of the Civil Service Commission Meeting Minutes of April 2, 2013.

VOTE: YES- Solis, Gomez, Munoz

NO: NONE

### **REGULAR AGENDA**

APPROVED - RULES REGARDING SETTLEMENT NEGOTIATIONS AND FILING REQUIREMENTS AND PROCEDURES TO INCLUDE ENTIRE SECTION ON DISCIPLINE/CORRECTIVE ACTION AND RULES 7.22, 7.24, & 7.26

MAY 7, 2013 MOTION #3

DISCUSS AND TAKE APPROPRIATE ACTION REGARDING CHANGES TO EL PASO COUNTY CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION RULES REGARDING SETTLEMENT NEGOTIATIONS AND FILING REQUIREMENTS AND PROCEDURES TO INCLUDE ENTIRE SECTION ON DISCIPLINE/CORRECTIVE ACTION AND ANY OTHER SECTION PROPOSED TO BE MODIFIED.

-- (Kevin McCary, County Attorney's Office & Human Resources)

On this day, on motion of Chair Solis, seconded by Commissioner Gomez, it is the order of the Commission to approve the changes to the El Paso County Civil Service Commission Rules regarding settlement negotiations and filing requirements as emailed to the Commission on May 7, 2013 pertaining to Rules 7.22, 7.24, and 7.26 with the changes that were articulated by Kevin McCary, County Attorney's Office as follows:

### GRIEVANCE RESOLUTION PROCEDURES

7.20 Revised: 06/18/07

Hearings before the El Paso County Civil Service Commission are De Novo\* and the grievant shall have the burden of proof by a preponderance of the evidence, except in cases involving dismissal, demotion or suspension. In cases involving dismissal, demotion, or suspension, the Elected Official/Department Head by whom the action was taken has the burden of proving by a preponderance of the evidence just grounds for the dismissal, demotion or suspension. \*De Novo means the Commission will conduct an evidentiary hearing and make a decision independent of any previous decisions or hearings.

7.21

Hearings before the El Paso County Civil Service Commission will be set for the next available meeting date that is at least twenty-one (21) days after the grievance is filed. If more time is needed to hear the matter, the Commission may continue the hearing to another date, either a specially set hearing date or the next regularly scheduled meeting.

# 7.22 Added: 06/03/13 - Effective 06/05/13

### PRE-HEARING MEETING AND OTHER PROCEDURES

It shall be the policy of the El Paso County Civil Service Commission to encourage the timely pre-hearing settlement of grievances. In keeping with this policy, all parties shall adhere to the following procedures:

- (a) Upon the filing of a grievance, Human Resources personnel shall advise
  the grievant of the existence of these Civil Service rules and provide a
  hyperlink to these rules on a paper form, as approved by the Human
  Resources Director. The grievant should acknowledge receipt by signing
  the form.
- (b) No fewer than 10 days nor more than 17 days from the filing of a grievance, the COUNTY ATTORNEY shall contact the grievant, or his or her attorney, if represented, and confirm that the grievant (or attorney) has obtained a copy of these rules and regulations;
- (c) The Parties may agree to arrange an Alternative Resolution Meeting

  (ARM). The purpose of an ARM meeting is to determine if a mutually acceptable resolution to the grievance can be achieved prior to the hearing.

  A member of County Human Resources staff, as assigned by the Director of Human Resources, shall be present at any ARM to facilitate

communication. County Human Resources staff may also assist the grievant with the ARM process if the grievant is not represented. However, Human Resources staff may not advocate on behalf of the grievant. In accordance with Texas law, discussions at an ARM are confidential and may not be recorded or otherwise entered into evidence at a grievance hearing or any other matter (see Texas Rule of Evidence 408). Parties may request a continuance in order to facilitate alternative resolution in accordance with rule 7.26.

### 7.23 7.22

(d)

All parties filing documents with the El Paso County Civil Service Commission shall serve a copy of the documents upon the opposing party at the same time.

# 7.24 7.23 Revised: 05/20/13

At least seven (7) days prior to the date set for the hearing, all parties shall furnish each other and the El Paso County Civil Service Commission with the names of the witnesses to be called, a summary of their expected testimony, and a copy of each document, record, or exhibit to be introduced at the hearing. In its submission, COUNTY shall also provide a brief report as to the existence of any alternative resolution discussions and indicate whether any tentative agreement has been reached. Each party is responsible for notifying the witness(es) and requesting the presence of its own witness(es). A party cannot rely on the other party's witness list as a guarantee that a witness will be present.

When either party requests a continuance, that party shall file a written motion with the El Paso County Civil Service Commission, setting forth the grounds upon which such motion is made.

Except for good cause shown, any such motion shall be made not less than seven (7) days prior

to the scheduled date of the hearing. If both parties agree to the continuance in writing and it is the first continuance of the hearing, the continuance shall be automatically granted and the Director of Human Resources is authorized to postpone the item until the next regularly scheduled Civil Service meeting.

## 7.25 7.23 ADDED: 12/07/09

The copy of each document, record, or exhibit provided by the department must be picked up by the grievant or designated party once he/she is notified that the documents are ready for pick up by the Human Resources Department. If a grievant has an e-mail address, the grievant has the option of having the documents e-mailed to them at the e-mail address they provide to the Human Resources Department. If the Human Resources Department is unable to e-mail the documents due to the electronic file size or if the grievant is unable to receive the documents via e-mail, the Human Resources Department shall notify the grievant and the grievant or their designated party must pick up the documents from the Human Resources Department.

### 7.26 <del>7.2</del>4

When either party requests a continuance, that party shall file a written motion with the El Paso County Civil Service Commission, setting forth the grounds upon which such motion is made. Except for good cause shown, any such motion shall be made not less than seven (7) days prior to the scheduled date of the hearing. If both parties agree to the continuance in writing and it is the first continuance of the hearing, the continuance shall be automatically granted and the Director of Human Resources is authorized to postpone the item until the next regularly scheduled Civil Service meeting provided however, that such request must be made at least seven (7) days before the hearing. A request for a continuance, made fewer than seven (7)

may not postpone the item without a hearing before the Commission. Both parties (and counsel) must be present for a hearing on any request for a continuance made fewer than (7) seven days before the hearing on the matter, even where the Parties agree to the continuance.

# 7.27 7.25

A decision by the El Paso County Civil Service Commission becomes final upon the expiration of thirty (30) days from the date the decision is announced in open session by the El Paso County Civil Service Commission, unless the grievant, Elected Official/Department Head or the El Paso County Civil Service Commission motions to re-open the original decision within that thirty (30) day period. If a motion to re-open is filed in a timely basis, the El Paso County Civil Service Commission will have thirty (30) days to decide whether to re-open the original hearing. The El Paso County Civil Service Commission may only re-open the original hearing upon good cause shown. If the El Paso County Civil Service Commission does not make a decision within thirty (30) days to re-open, the decision becomes final on the 30<sup>th</sup> day after the motion to re-open was filed.

### 7.28 <del>7.26</del>

"Good cause" may include newly discovered evidence which was not readily available at the time of the hearing despite reasonable efforts having been made to obtain the evidence, inability to have witness(es) appear despite reasonable efforts having been made to secure the attendance of the witness(es), unexpected illness or injury to any party or witness, or when the El Paso County Civil Service Commission's decision is contrary to law.

# 7.29 7.27

If a motion to re-open is granted, the El Paso County Civil Service Commission shall schedule the matter for hearing for the next regularly scheduled Civil Service meeting and shall designate the issues to be considered at that hearing. Only evidence relevant and material to those issues so designated shall be admissible at that hearing. The decision by the El Paso County Civil Service Commission following this hearing becomes final upon announcement in open session.

VOTE: YES-Solis, Gomez, Munoz

NO: NONE

### ACCEPTED - COUNTY CLERK'S POLICIES AND PROCEDURES

MAY 7, 2013

**MOTION #2 (ITEM #2)** 

DISCUSS AND TAKE APPROPRIATE ACTION TO ACCEPT THE EL PASO COUNTY CLERK'S POLICIES AND PROCEDURES.

-- (Delia Briones, County Clerk)

On this day, on motion of Chair Solis, seconded by Commissioner Munoz, it is the order of the Commission to accept the El Paso County Clerk's Policies and Procedures for filing purposes.

VOTE: YES-Solis, Gomez, Munoz

NO: NONE

# DISMISSED – GRIEVANCE ON BERTHA SANDRA RODRIGUEZ DUE TO LACK OF JURSIDICTION

MAY 7, 2013

**MOTION #4 (ITEM #3)** 

DISCUSS AND DETERMINE WHETHER A GRIEVANCE FILED/DATED MARCH 18, 2013, BY BERTHA SANDRA RODRIGUEZ, OFFICE SPECIALIST, INTERMEDIATE, PERTAINING TO ANTI-HARASSMENT POLICY — RULE 5.08 IS WITHIN THE JURISDICTION OF THE EL PASO COUNTY CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION. IF JURISDICTION IS FOUND, THE GRIEVANCE WILL BE HEARD ON THE NEXT REGULAR SCHEDULED CIVIL SERVICE MIEETING.

-- (Bertha Sandra Rodriguez, County Clerk's Office) (Delia Briones, County Clerk - Ruben Duarte, County Attorney's Office)

On this day, HR staff announced that the Civil Service Commission would recess into executive session at 2:09 p.m. to discuss the following item, pursuant to *Texas Government Code* §551.071. The Commission would reconvene to take official action.

On this day the Civil Service Commission reconvened into regular open session at 2:24 p.m.

On this day, on motion of Commissioner Solis, seconded by Commissioner Gomez, it is the order of the Commission to dismiss the grievance filed/dated March 18, 2013, by Bertha Sandra Rodriguez, Office Specialist, Intermediate, pertaining to Anti-Harassment Policy – Rule 5.08, due to the fact that this matter is not within the jurisdiction of the El Paso County Civil Service Commission.

VOTE: YES- Solis, Gomez, Munoz NO: NONE

### **GRIEVANCES**

# EXECUTIVE SESSION: PURSUANT TO TEXAS GOVERNMENT CODE \$551.074

On this day, HR staff announced that the Civil Service Commission would remain in open session at 2:26 p.m. to discuss the following item, pursuant to *Texas Government Code* §551.074.

**ITEMS #4 - #5 (MOTION #5)** 

### DELETED - GRIEVANCE REGARDING LAURA I. MEZA

**(POSTPONED 04/02/2013)** TAKE APPROPRIATE ACTION ON A GRIEVANCE FILED/DATED JANUARY 25, 2013 REGARDING LAURA I. MEZA PERTAINING TO TERMINATION & RULES 7.09 (A), (B), & (D).

-- (Laura I. Meza, Assistant Office Manager – Jonathon Bramble, AFSCME Representative) (Victor Flores, County Tax Assessor – Kathleen Anderson, Senior Trial Attorney)

On this day, on motion of Chair Solis, seconded by Commissioner Munoz, it is the order of the Commission to delete the grievance filed/dated January 25, 2013 regarding Laura I Meza, pertaining to Termination & Rules 7.09 (A), (B), & (D), due to a settlement agreement by both parties.

VOTE: YES- Solis, Gomez, Munoz NO: NONE

### **MEETING ADJOURNED**

MAY 7, 2013

**MOTION #7 (ITEM #6)** 

On this day, there being no further business to discuss, Commissioner Gomez moved to adjourn the meeting at 2:28 p.m. seconded by Commissioner Munoz.

VOTE: YES - Solis, Gomez

NO: NONE

EXAMINED AND APPROVED THIS 4<sup>TH</sup> DAY IN JUNE 2013

SELENA N. SOLIS, CHAIR

ESTELA SALGADO, RECORDING SECRETARY